Reference ID	Created	Released	Classification	Origin
<u>02ROME1196</u>	2002-03-07 10:10	2010-12-15 16:04	CONFIDENTIAL	Embassy Rome

This record is a partial extract of the original cable. The full text of the original cable is not available.

Thursday, 07 March 2002, 10:13

C O N F I D E N T I A L SECTION 01 OF 02 ROME 001196

SIPDIS

CORRECTED COPY (ADDED INFO ADDEES)

DEPARTMENT FOR EUR/WE, EUR/PPD AND DRL

EO 12958 DECL: 03/05/2007

TAGS PHUM, OPRC, OPRC, OPRC, IT, ITPHUM, ITPHUM, HUMAN RIGHTS

SUBJECT: AS PREDICTED, ITALY'S HUMAN RIGHTS REPORT

GENERATES FODDER FOR DOMESTIC POLITICAL MILLS

REF: A. STATE 40721

CONFIDENTIAL

PAGE 02 ROME 01196 01 OF 02 082030Z B. ROME 1098 C. ROME 894 D. MYRIAD POST-DEPARTMENT E-MAILS FROM 10/01-02/02 E. ROME 348

CLASSIFIED BY: POL MINCOUNS THOMAS COUNTRYMAN, REASONS 1.5 (B) AND (D).

- $\underline{\mathbb{I}}1.$ (C) SUMMARY: AS POST PREDICTED, THE U.S. COUNTRY REPORT FOR ITALY PROVIDED IMMEDIATE GRIST FOR DOMESTIC POLITICAL MILLS. PAPERS POUNCED ON THE REPORT TO TRUMPET "HUMAN RIGHTS: U.S. 'FLUNKS' ITALY;" "POLICE ABUSES IN ITALY;" AND ESPECIALLY "MISTREATMENT OF DETAINEES" BY THE ITALIAN POLICE DURING G-8 MEETINGS LAST JULY, WITH THE ONGOING STORY THAT "THE FIFTEEN PAGES THAT THE REPORT DEVOTES TO ITALY LOOK LIKE A FULL-FLEDGED INDICTMENT OF THE BEHAVIOR OF THE GOVERNMENT DURING THE G-8 IN GENOA." ABSENT THE GUIDANCE REQUESTED FROM THE DEPARTMENT (REFS B AND C), WE HAD TO IMPROVISE IN OUR DISCUSSIONS WITH THE FOREIGN MINISTRY, WHICH WAS NOTICEABLY IRRITATED BY THE REPORT. INTERIOR MINISTER SCAJOLA EXPRESSED HIS DISAPPOINTMENT IN A MARCH 5 MEETING WITH THE AMBASSADOR. END SUMMARY.
- $\underline{\mathbb{I}}$ 2. (SBU) POLOFF DELIVERED THE ITALY HUMAN RIGHTS REPORT TO MFA NORTH AMERICA OFFICE DIRECTOR GERI SCHIAVONI AND HUMAN RIGHTS OFFICE COUNSELOR ALBERTO CECCARELLI MARCH 5. (MUTUAL SCHEDULING CONFLICTS HAD PREVENTED DELIVERY THE AFTERNOON OF MARCH 4, PRIOR TO WASHINGTON PUBLICATION, BUT THE MFA WAS AWARE THAT THE REPORT WAS TO BE RELEASED AND THAT WE WERE SEEKING TO DELIVER IT IN ADVANCE OF ITS PUBLIC RELEASE.)

CONFIDENTIAL

PAGE 03 ROME 01196 01 OF 02 082030Z 3. (SBU) AS WE HAD PREDICTED (REFS B, C, AND D), THE ITALIAN PRESS HAD A FIELD DAY WITH THE REPORT. SOME OF THE CHOICER HEADLINES INCLUDED: "'NO-GLOBALS' WERE MISTREATED. THE U.S. CRITICIZES ITALY" (CENTRIST CORRIERE DELLA SERA); "POLICE ABUSES IN ITALY" (LEFTIST LA REPUBBLICA); "HUMAN RIGHTS: U.S. FLUNKS ITALY" (CENTRIST LA STAMPA); "HUMAN RIGHTS: DEPARTMENT OF STATE - THE U.S. TO BERLUSCONI: 'LEGALITY IN DANGER'" (LEFTIST L'UNITA). LA REPUBBLICA CONTINUED THAT "THE FIFTEEN FULL PAGES THAT THE REPORT DEVOTES TO ITALY LOOK LIKE A FULL-FLEDGED INDICTMENT OF THE BEHAVIOR OF THE GOVERNMENT DURING THE G-8 IN GENOA. THERE ARE ALSO EMBARRASSING REFERENCES

TO SILVIO BERLUSCONI, WHO IS MENTIONED REGARDING FREEDOM OF THE PRESS AND THE LEGAL SYSTEM."

- $\underline{\mathbb{I}}4$. (C) OUR MFA INTERLOCUTORS MADE CLEAR THEIR DISSATISFACTION WITH THE REPORT. "THE ITALY REPORT IS THAT LONG?" SCHIAVONI ASKED IN AMAZEMENT. "WHY WOULD YOU WRITE SO MUCH ON ANOTHER DEMOCRACY?" SCHIAVONI, NORMALLY AMONG OUR MOST GRACIOUS AND GOOD-NATURED OF CONTACTS, CHASTISED POLOFF AT LENGTH ABOUT THE NEED FOR POST TO ENSURE THAT WHAT WAS REPORTED ABOUT ITALY WAS CONVEYED IN THE PROPER CONTEXT AND PROVIDED WITH SUFFICIENT NUANCE. "THAT'S WHAT AN EMBASSY'S RESPONSIBILITY IS," HE INSISTED. (COMMENT: WE AGREE. END COMMENT.)
- $\underline{\mathbb{I}}$ 5. (C) IN THE ABSENCE OF THE GUIDANCE REPEATEDLY (REFS B AND C) REQUESTED, WE WERE FORCED TO "WING IT" IN OUR CONVERSATION AT THE MFA. (FOR BETTER OR WORSE, PRESS REPORTS WERE WRITTEN BY WASHINGTON CORRESPONDENTS. ROME-BASED MEDIA HAVE NOT CONTACTED US FOR CLARIFICATION OR COMMENT.) WE CONFIDENTIAL
- PAGE 04 ROME 01196 01 OF 02 082030Z EMPHASIZED THAT THE ITALIAN REPORT WAS WRITTEN UNDER THE SAME GUIDELINES AS THOSE FOR ALL COUNTRIES, AND URGED OUR INTERLOCUTORS TO COMPARE THE ITALIAN REPORT WITH THE ONES FOR GERMANY OR FRANCE, FOR EXAMPLE. (SCHIAVONI AND CECCARELLI WERE NOT IMPRESSED.) WE URGED THEM TO READ THE REPORT ITSELF AND NOT PRESS ARTICLES "INTERPRETING" IT. WE ESPECIALLY CLARIFIED THAT THE REPORT DRAWS NO CONCLUSIONS AS TO THE GUILT OR INNOCENCE OF THOSE CONNECTED WITH EVENTS SURROUNDING THE JULY G-8 SUMMIT, NOTES ACCURATELY THE CONTEXT OF THE EVENTS, AND EXPLAINS THAT A GOVERNMENT INVESTIGATION INTO THE EVENTS IS ON-GOING. WE URGED THE GOI ALSO TO REFRAIN FROM DRAWING INFERENCES ON THE BASIS OF THE REPORT.
- $\underline{\mathbb{I}}$ 6. (C) IN A MARCH 5 MEETING WITH THE AMBASSADOR, INTERIOR MINISTER SCAJOLA --WHO REMAINS UNDER FIRE FROM THE OPPOSITION FOR LAST JULY'S EVENTS LARGELY, AS WE HAVE REPORTED, BECAUSE THE CENTER-LEFT HAS SO FEW ISSUES THAT RESONATE AMONG THE ITALIAN PUBLIC -- EXPRESSED HIS DISAPPOINTMENT WITH THE REPORT, BASED ON PRESS REPORTING. THE AMBASSADOR URGED SCAJOLA TO READ THE REPORT ITSELF, NOT MEDIA ACCOUNTS OF IT. DCM CLARIFIED THAT THE REPORT WAS WRITTEN IN ACCORDANCE WITH DEPARTMENT GUIDANCE AND THE ITALIAN REPORT WAS SIMILAR TO THAT FOR CANADA, GERMANY, FRANCE OR ANY WESTERN COUNTRY. SCAJOLA ACKNOWLEDGED THAT THE SECTIONS OF THE REPORT HE HAD TRANSLATED INTO ITALIAN DID NOT ENTIRELY MATCH PRESS STORIES ABOUT IT, BUT REMAINED DISAPPOINTED THAT THE REPORT HAD PROVIDED AMMUNITION TO THE OPPOSITION.
- ¶7. (C) COMMENT: POST WILL CONTINUE TO FOLLOW THE LINE

CONFIDENTIAL

PAGE 05 ROME 01196 01 OF 02 082030Z

CONFIDENTIAL

CONFIDENTIAL PTQ7827

PAGE 01 ROME 01196 02 OF 02 082031Z ACTION EUR-00

C O N F I D E N T I A L SECTION 02 OF 02 ROME 001196

SIPDIS

C O R R E C T E D C O P Y (ADDED INFO ADDEES)

DEPARTMENT FOR EUR/WE, EUR/PPD AND DRL E.O. 12958: DECL: 03/05/2007 TAGS: PHUM OPRC OPRC OPRC OPRC IT ITPHUM ITPHUM HUMAN RIGHTS

ESTABLISHED IN THESE MEETINGS, URGING ALL TO AVOID INFERENCES, PARTICULARLY CONCERNING EVENTS ASSOCIATED WITH CONFIDENTIAL

PAGE 02 ROME 01196 02 OF 02 082031Z G-8 DEMONSTRATIONS OR PM BERLUSCONI'S JUDICIAL PROCESSES. IN PARTICULAR, STATEMENTS OF FACT IN THE REPORT SHOULD NOT BE READ AS JUDGMENTS OR AS A SCORECARD. WE REMAIN DISSATISFIED WITH THE ITERATIVE PROCESS OF DRAFTING THIS YEAR'S REPORT. ALTHOUGH SEVERAL OF OUR CONCERNS WERE ADDRESSED AT THE END, THE FINAL PRODUCT IS NOT AS CONSISTENT OR DEFENSIBLE AS IT SHOULD HAVE BEEN.

18. (C) COMMENT, CONTINUED: WE DO NOT WANT TO SEE AN ALREADY DELICATE SITUATION — WHERE THE USG HAS BEEN DRAWN INTO THE CENTER-LEFT OPPOSITION'S PREVIOUSLY LARGELY UNHEARD ACCUSATIONS AGAINST A RELATIVELY POPULAR GOVERNMENT — MADE WORSE. ABSENT ANY OTHER ATTRACTIVE ISSUE, OPPOSITION PARLIAMENTARIANS AND THEIR PRESS COUNTERPARTS WILL CONTINUE TO RESURRECT THE GOVERNMENT'S HANDLING OF THE G-8 AND BERLUSCONI'S JUDICIAL CASES. AND FROM NOW ON, THEY WILL — RIGHTLY OR WRONGLY — PROCLAIM USG "SUPPORT" FOR THEIR POINT OF VIEW. WE HOPE THAT OUR MFA CONTACTS, LIKE MINISTER SCAJOLA, WILL READ THE REPORT AND MOVE ON — ALTHOUGH WE EXPECT TO HAVE AT LEAST ONE FURTHER EXCHANGE ONCE THEY HAVE HAD TIME TO READ THE REPORT CAREFULLY. UNFORTUNATELY, WE ARE NOT ABLE TO CONTROL THE TENOR OF MEDIA REPORTS, AND AS WE NOTED REF E, MEDIA WARS ARE A CONTINUATION OF POLITICS BY OTHER MEANS. ITALY'S OPPOSITION WILL CONTINUE TO HURL THE STONES THAT COME TO HAND IN THEIR EFFORTS TO UNSEAT A POPULAR PRIME MINISTER, AND WE JUST HANDED THEM SOME NEW ONES. POPE

CONFIDENTIAL

> @@@OASYS@@@

CONFIDENTIAL PTQ2121

PAGE 01 ROME 01196 01 OF 02 071049Z ACTION EUR-00

INFO LOG-00 NP-00 AID-00 AMAD-00 CIAE-00 INL-00 DODE-00 SRPP-00 EB-00 VC-00 H-01 TEDE-00 INR-00 IO-00 LAB-01 L-00 VCE-00 NSAE-00 NSCE-00 OIC-02 OPIC-01 PC-01 PM-00 PRS-00 P-00 SP-00 STR-00 TRSE-00 USIE-00 IIP-00 SNIS-00 NISC-00 PMB-00 PRM-00 DRL-02 G-00 SAS-00 /008W ------------------70C954 071049Z /38 O 071013Z MAR 02 FM AMEMBASSY ROME TO SECSTATE WASHDC IMMEDIATE 2620 INFO EUROPEAN POLITICAL COLLECTIVE

C O N F I D E N T I A L SECTION 01 OF 02 ROME 001196

SIPDIS

DEPARTMENT FOR EUR/WE, EUR/PPD AND DRL

E.O. 12958: DECL: 03/05/2007 TAGS: PHUM OPRC OPRC OPRC OPRC IT ITPHUM ITPHUM HUMAN RIGHTS

REF: A. STATE 40721 B. ROME 1098 C. ROME 894 D. MYRIAD POST-DEPARTMENT E-MAILS FROM 10/01-02/02 E. ROME 348

CONFIDENTIAL

PAGE 02 ROME 01196 01 OF 02 071049Z CLASSIFIED BY: POL MINCOUNS THOMAS COUNTRYMAN, REASONS 1.5 (B) AND (D).

 $\underline{\mathbb{I}}$ 1. (C) SUMMARY: AS POST PREDICTED, THE U.S. COUNTRY REPORT FOR ITALY PROVIDED IMMEDIATE GRIST FOR DOMESTIC POLITICAL MILLS. PAPERS POUNCED ON THE REPORT TO TRUMPET "HUMAN RIGHTS: U.S. 'FLUNKS' ITALY;" "POLICE ABUSES IN ITALY;" AND ESPECIALLY "MISTREATMENT OF DETAINEES" BY THE ITALIAN POLICE DURING G-8 MEETINGS LAST JULY, WITH THE ONGOING STORY THAT "THE FIFTEEN PAGES THAT THE REPORT DEVOTES TO ITALY LOOK LIKE A FULL-FLEDGED INDICTMENT OF THE BEHAVIOR OF THE GOVERNMENT DURING THE G-8 IN GENOA." ABSENT THE GUIDANCE REQUESTED FROM THE DEPARTMENT (REFS B AND C), WE HAD TO IMPROVISE IN OUR DISCUSSIONS WITH THE FOREIGN MINISTRY, WHICH WAS NOTICEABLY IRRITATED BY THE REPORT. INTERIOR

MINISTER SCAJOLA EXPRESSED HIS DISAPPOINTMENT IN A MARCH 5 MEETING WITH THE AMBASSADOR. END SUMMARY.

- $\underline{\mathbb{I}}$ 2. (SBU) POLOFF DELIVERED THE ITALY HUMAN RIGHTS REPORT TO MFA NORTH AMERICA OFFICE DIRECTOR GERI SCHIAVONI AND HUMAN RIGHTS OFFICE COUNSELOR ALBERTO CECCARELLI MARCH 5. (MUTUAL SCHEDULING CONFLICTS HAD PREVENTED DELIVERY THE AFTERNOON OF MARCH 4, PRIOR TO WASHINGTON PUBLICATION, BUT THE MFA WAS AWARE THAT THE REPORT WAS TO BE RELEASED AND THAT WE WERE SEEKING TO DELIVER IT IN ADVANCE OF ITS PUBLIC RELEASE.)
- 43. (SBU) AS WE HAD PREDICTED (REFS B, C, AND D), THE ITALIAN PRESS HAD A FIELD DAY WITH THE REPORT. SOME OF THE CHOICER HEADLINES INCLUDED: "'NO-GLOBALS' WERE MISTREATED. THE U.S. CRITICIZES ITALY" (CENTRIST CORRIERE DELLA SERA); "POLICE ABUSES IN ITALY" (LEFTIST LA REPUBBLICA); "HUMAN RIGHTS: U.S. FLUNKS ITALY" (CENTRIST LA STAMPA); "HUMAN CONFIDENTIAL
- PAGE 03 ROME 01196 01 OF 02 071049Z RIGHTS: DEPARTMENT OF STATE THE U.S. TO BERLUSCONI: 'LEGALITY IN DANGER'" (LEFTIST L'UNITA). LA REPUBBLICA CONTINUED THAT "THE FIFTEEN FULL PAGES THAT THE REPORT DEVOTES TO ITALY LOOK LIKE A FULL-FLEDGED INDICTMENT OF THE BEHAVIOR OF THE GOVERNMENT DURING THE G-8 IN GENOA. THERE ARE ALSO EMBARRASSING REFERENCES TO SILVIO BERLUSCONI, WHO IS MENTIONED REGARDING FREEDOM OF THE PRESS AND THE LEGAL SYSTEM."
- $\underline{\mathbb{I}}4$. (C) OUR MFA INTERLOCUTORS MADE CLEAR THEIR DISSATISFACTION WITH THE REPORT. "THE ITALY REPORT IS THAT LONG?" SCHIAVONI ASKED IN AMAZEMENT. "WHY WOLD YOU WRITE SO MUCH ON ANOTHER DEMOCRACY?" SCHIVONI, NORMALLY AMONG OUR MOST GRACIOUS AND GOOD-ATURED OF CONTACTS, CHASTISED POLOFF AT LENGTH AOUT THE NEED FOR POST TO ENSURE THAT WHAT WAS REORTED ABOUT ITALY WAS CONVEYEDIN THE PROPER CONTEXT AND PROVIDED WITH SUFFICIENT NUANCE. "THAT'S WHAT AN EMBASSY'S RESPONSIBILITY IS," HE INSISTED. (COMMENT: WE AGREE. END COMMENT.)
- 15. (C) IN THE ABSENCE OF THE GUIDANCE REPEATEDLY (REFS B AND C) REQUESTED, WE WERE FORCED TO "WING IT" IN OUR CONVERSATION AT THE MFA. (FOR BETTER OR WORSE, PRESS REPORTS WERE WRITTEN BY WASHINGTON CORRESPONDENTS. ROME-BASED MEDIA HAVE NOT CONTACTED US FOR CLARIFICATION OR COMMENT.) WE EMPHASIZED THAT THE ITALIAN REPORT WAS WRITTEN UNDER THE SAME GUIDELINES AS THOSE FOR ALL COUNTRIES, AND URGED OUR INTERLOCUTORS TO COMPARE THE ITALIAN REPORT WITH THE ONES FOR GERMANY OR FRANCE, FOR EXAMPLE. (SCHIAVONI AND CECCARELLI WERE NOT IMPRESSED.) WE URGED THEM TO READ THE REPORT ITSELF AND NOT PRESS ARTICLES "INTERPRETING" IT. WE ESPECIALLY CONFIDENTIAL
- PAGE 04 ROME 01196 01 OF 02 071049Z CLARIFIED THAT THE REPORT DRAWS NO CONCLUSIONS AS TO THE GUILT OR INNOCENCE OF THOSE CONNECTED WITH EVENTS SURROUNDING THE JULY G-8 SUMMIT, NOTES ACCURATELY THE CONTEXT OF THE EVENTS, AND EXPLAINS THAT A GOVERNMENT INVESTIGATION INTO THE EVENTS IS ON-GOING. WE URGED THE GOI ALSO TO REFRAIN FROM DRAWING INFERENCES ON THE BASIS OF THE REPORT.
- 16. (C) IN A MARCH 5 MEETING WITH THE AMBASSADOR, INTERIOR MINISTER SCAJOLA --WHO REMAINS UNDER FIRE FROM THE OPPOSITION FOR LAST JULY'S EVENTS LARGELY, AS WE HAVE REPORTED, BECAUSE THE CENTER-LEFT HAS SO FEW ISSUES THAT RESONATE AMONG THE ITALIAN PUBLIC -- EXPRESSED HIS DISAPPOINTMENT WITH THE REPORT, BASED ON PRESS REPORTING. THE AMBASSADOR URGED SCAJOLA TO READ THE REPORT ITSELF, NOT MEDIA ACCOUNTS OF IT. DCM CLARIFIED THAT THE REPORT WAS WRITTEN IN ACCORDANCE WITH DEPARTMENT GUIDANCE AND THE ITALIAN REPORT WAS SIMILAR TO THAT FOR CANADA, GERMANY, FRANCE OR ANY WESTERN COUNTRY. SCAJOLA ACKNOWLEDGED THAT THE SECTIONS OF THE REPORT HE HAD TRANSLATED INTO ITALIAN DID NOT ENTIRELY MATCH PRESS STORIES ABOUT IT, BUT REMAINED DISAPPOINTED THAT THE REPORT HAD PROVIDED AMMUNITION TO THE OPPOSITION.
- $\P7.$ (C) COMMENT: POST WILL CONTINUE TO FOLLOW THE LINE

CONFIDENTIAL

CONFIDENTIAL PTQ2122

PAGE 01 ROME 01196 02 OF 02 071049Z ACTION EUR-00

C O N F I D E N T I A L SECTION 02 OF 02 ROME 001196

SIPDIS

DEPARTMENT FOR EUR/WE, EUR/PPD AND DRL

E.O. 12958: DECL: 03/05/2007 TAGS: PHUM OPRC OPRC OPRC OPRC IT ITPHUM ITPHUM HUMAN RIGHTS

ESTABLISHED IN THESE MEETINGS, URGING ALL TO AVOID INFERENCES, PARTICULARLY CONCERNING EVENTS ASSOCIATED WITH G-8 DEMONSTRATIONS OR PM BERLUSCONI'S JUDICIAL PROCESSES. IN PARTICULAR, STATEMENTS OF FACT IN THE REPORT SHOULD NOT BE READ AS JUDGMENTS OR AS A SCORECARD. WE REMAIN DISSATISFIED WITH THE ITERATIVE PROCESS OF DRAFTING THIS YEAR'S REPORT. CONFIDENTIAL

PAGE 02 ROME 01196 02 OF 02 071049Z ALTHOUGH SEVERAL OF OUR CONCERNS WERE ADDRESSED AT THE END, THE FINAL PRODUCT IS NOT AS CONSISTENT OR DEFENSIBLE AS IT SHOULD HAVE BEEN.

18. (C) COMMENT, CONTINUED: WE DO NOT WANT TO SEE AN ALREADY DELICATE SITUATION — WHERE THE USG HAS BEEN DRAWN INTO THE CENTER-LEFT OPPOSITION'S PREVIOUSLY LARGELY UNHEARD ACCUSATIONS AGAINST A RELATIVELY POPULAR GOVERNMENT — MADE WORSE. ABSENT ANY OTHER ATTRACTIVE ISSUE, OPPOSITION PARLIAMENTARIANS AND THEIR PRESS COUNTERPARTS WILL CONTINUE TO RESURRECT THE GOVERNMENT'S HANDLING OF THE G-8 AND BERLUSCONI'S JUDICIAL CASES. AND FROM NOW ON, THEY WILL — RIGHTLY OR WRONGLY — PROCLAIM USG "SUPPORT" FOR THEIR POINT OF VIEW. WE HOPE THAT OUR MFA CONTACTS, LIKE MINISTER SCAJOLA, WILL READ THE REPORT AND MOVE ON — ALTHOUGH WE EXPECT TO HAVE AT LEAST ONE FURTHER EXCHANGE ONCE THEY HAVE HAD TIME TO READ THE REPORT CAREFULLY. UNFORTUNATELY, WE ARE NOT ABLE TO CONTROL THE TENOR OF MEDIA REPORTS, AND AS WE NOTED REF E, MEDIA WARS ARE A CONTINUATION OF POLITICS BY OTHER MEANS. ITALY'S OPPOSITION WILL CONTINUE TO HURL THE STONES THAT COME TO HAND IN THEIR EFFORTS TO UNSEAT A POPULAR PRIME MINISTER, AND WE JUST HANDED THEM SOME NEW ONES. POPE

CONFIDENTIAL

> 2002ROME01196 - Classification: CONFIDENTIAL